

Analysis of Zoning System Issues in New Student Admission to Achieve Efforts for Education Access Equalization: A Literature Review

Vika Ardianti*, Ahmad Yusuf Sobri, Aan Fardani Ubaidillah

Universitas Negeri Malang, Jl. Semarang No. 5 Malang, Jawa Timur, Indonesia

*Penulis korespondensi, Surel: vika.ardianti.2301328@students.um.ac.id

Abstract

The problem of equalizing access to education is one of the educational problems that is still not resolved until now. There have been many efforts made by the government related to equalizing access to education, one of which is in equalizing education in an area. One of them is in the process of admitting new students, the government implements a zoning system. The PPDB policy by implementing a zoning system is one of the policies issued by the government in the hope that it will be the right policy in overcoming equal access to education. PPDB with a zoning system is contained in the Regulation of the Minister of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia Number 51 of 2017 concerning Acceptance of New Learners in Kindergartens, Elementary Schools, Junior High Schools, Senior High Schools, and Vocational High Schools. This research aims to analyze the problems of the zoning system PPDB as an effort to realize efforts to equalize access to education. The approach method applied is a literature study that obtains research articles on Google Scholar. The results show that the implementation of the zoning system PPDB is in accordance with the Permendikbud but it cannot be denied that there are internal and external factors that affect the process of implementing the Zoning system PPDB policy.

Keywords: Problems with zoning system; PPDB; education access

1. Introduction

The portrait of education in Indonesia throughout the ages until now still depicts the same issue, which is educational disparity. This educational disparity can be seen in the infrastructure development in each region and the distribution of educators to education, which tends to show no improvement each year. Based on data from research by Rosmana et al. (2022), it is found that there is still a shortage of educators and education in rural areas due to uneven distribution of educators to education. Not only that, the research findings also mention that the infrastructure in remote and underdeveloped areas is very poor, as evidenced by the presence of educators and education workers living in wall-less shacks. Such conditions are in stark contrast to those in urban areas, such as in Java. This becomes one of the main factors for educators not wanting to be placed in areas other than urban areas. Sahira (2023) explains that education equality in remote areas plays a crucial role in improving the quality of education in Indonesia as a whole. Therefore, the government, educational institutions, and society are needed to promote the sustainability of plans and programs aimed at educational equality.

The Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia Year 1945 article 31 verse 2 states that every citizen has the right to education. Every citizen is entitled to quality education regardless of ethnicity, religion, race, group, economic status, and social status. This effort requires the government to provide access to education in the process of admitting students to a school. The government has made many efforts related to equalizing access to education, one of which is to equalize education in a region. Muammar (2019) explains that educational equalization consists

of two important aspects, namely equality and equity. Equality means equal opportunities in accessing education, while equity means fairness in the process of accessing educational opportunities among society layers. Thus, equalizing access to education means that all school-aged populations have the opportunity for education, and educational access can be considered fair if different societal groups can experience equal education.

Therefore, to fulfill these crucial aspects, the government issued a policy on the new student admission system based on zoning. The policy of New Student Admission (PPDB) by implementing a zoning system is one of the policies issued by the government with the hope of being the right policy to address equalizing access to education. PPDB with a zoning system is stipulated in the Regulation of the Minister of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia Number 51 of 2017 concerning the Admission of New Students in Kindergarten, Elementary School, Junior High School, High School, and Vocational High School. This zoning system PPDB applies admission procedures based on the radius of the distance from home to school. The system requires students to attend schools within a close radius of their residence based on family card data. The zoning system requires public schools to accept prospective students residing within the nearest zone radius, at least 90% of the number of students accepted. The determination of the zoning radius in the implementation of the zoning system refers to the conditions of each area, so each area will have different criteria for the radius boundary. The zoning system has three entry paths for prospective students, including 90% of the quota for prospective students based on the area radius, 5% of the quota for prospective students through achievement paths, and the remaining quota for students who have relocated. The application of the zoning system does not apply to state vocational schools. The implementation of the zoning system is the government's effort to improve the equalization of education, which is one of the problems of the education system in Indonesia. In addition to addressing the problem of equalizing school access for the public, the zoning system is also expected to be a new step in eliminating school exclusivity. This exclusivity can be seen when there is labeling of schools formed by the community. This labeling includes terms like "excellent schools," "favorite schools," and "unpopular schools." The exclusivity of school institutions ultimately leads to differentiation and stratification among schools.

Sunandar & Kurniawan (2022) However, in reality, many complaints from parents arise because their children's hard work to achieve good grades is in vain since they cannot get into their desired schools, and those who feel close to the school lose out to students who are suddenly listed on their family card (KK) as being closer to the school. This disappointment persists throughout the implementation of the zoning system PPDB policy in each new academic year. Based on these issues, the researcher intends to conduct an analysis with meta-analysis regarding the problems of the zoning system PPDB as an effort to achieve equal access to education.

2. Method

Gall & Borg (2003) Systematic review is one of the systematic document research methods used to synthesize research results. This method differs from nonsystematic reviews (traditional reviews) because it involves sequential and systematic stages, similar to the stages in research methodology in general. According to Kitchenham (2004), systematic literature review means identifying, evaluating, and interpreting all relevant existing research for a specific research question, topic area, or particular phenomenon of interest to the researcher. From this definition, it means that this method falls into the category of systematic textual

analysis. Textual analysis itself, according to Frey et al. (1999), is a communication method used by researchers to describe and interpret the characteristics of recorded or visual messages. The goal of textual analysis is to describe the content, structure, and function of messages within the text. Important considerations in textual analysis include selecting the type of text to be examined, obtaining the appropriate text, and determining a specific approach to analyze it. Kitchenham (2004) adds that individual studies contributing to a systematic review are called primary studies. Based on this, it means that a systematic review is a form of secondary study. The stages in a systematic review are divided into three main phases: planning, conducting, and reporting the review. The planning phase involves identifying the need for a review and developing its protocol. The execution phase involves identifying research, selecting primary studies, assessing study quality, data extraction and monitoring, as well as data synthesis.

3. Result and Discussion

3.1. Result

No	Researcher	Title	Result
1	(Dyanti, 2020)	Problematika Sistem Zonasi Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru Tahun Ajaran 2019 : Studi Kasus Sman 1 Bojongsoang Bandung,Desa Tegalluar, Kecamatan Bojongsoang, Kabupaten Bandung, Provinsi Jawa Barat	The research findings indicate that the implementation of PPDB with zoning system at SMAN 1 Bojongsoang has been carried out in accordance with the established guidelines. However, the application of the zoning system has led to several issues, particularly related to geographical location. There are areas near the school premises with several neighboring schools. Prospective students face challenges in reducing their interest in learning, feeling restricted in their rights, and experiencing difficulties in the registration process. SMAN 1 Bojongsoang has made various efforts to address these issues, such as requesting an extension of PPDB time from the Provincial authorities, establishing cooperation and conducting socialization with nearby schools, and implementing flexibility in the implementation of PPDB with zoning system to assist prospective students in the registration process.
2	(Khodijah, Mansur, & Nasrullah, 2020)	Analisis Problematika Sistem Zonasi Pada Keefektifan Proses Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Di Sma Negeri 2 Malang	The research findings reveal issues arising after the implementation of the zoning system at SMA Negeri 2 Malang, namely the low effectiveness of the Islamic Education learning process due to decreased student interest. The decline in student interest is influenced by low economic backgrounds and a lack of attention to education in the students' family environment, particularly regarding religious education. The conclusion of this research is that the process The Islamic Education learning process at SMA Negeri 2 Malang became less effective after the implementation of the zoning system. To address this issue, the Islamic Education teachers have taken measures such as enhancing school facilities to support student learning and implementing strategies

No	Researcher	Title	Result
3	(Sihombing & Hadit, 2021)	Persamaan Hak Atas Pendidikan Terhadap Penerapan Sistem Zonasi (Equality Of The Right To Education To The Application Of The Zoning System)	recommended by the government for Islamic Education teaching. As a suggestion, there is a need for an improvement in strategies by all parties in the school, especially Islamic Education teachers, to enhance the effectiveness of Islamic Education teaching at SMA Negeri 2 Malang. Consequently, the Islamic Education learning process can run effectively, and the objectives of Islamic Education teaching at SMA Negeri 2 Malang can be achieved successfully. The research findings indicate that the implementation of the policy has led to a violation of the right to education as mandated by Article 28C paragraph (1) and Article 31 paragraph (2) of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, which emphasizes that in the process of admitting new students, "merit" should be the primary consideration in determining school capacity quotas, followed by affirmative action and parent/guardian relocation pathways to achieve equitable and balanced rights to education.
4	(Damayanti, 2021)	Problematika Birokrasi Dalam Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru Dengan Sistem Zonasi Di Smp N 1 Saptosari Gunungkidul Yogyakarta	The research findings affirm that the implementation of the zoning system policy in SMP N 1 Saptosari Gunungkidul Yogyakarta continues despite facing several administrative challenges, both internally and externally. Based on the research findings using six variables according to the Van Meter and Van Horn theory, which are policy size and objectives, resources, characteristics of implementing agents, attitudes (dispositions), communication among implementing organizations, and social environment, there are issues in its execution. These issues include the unchanged mindset of the community towards prestigious schools, frequent errors and buffering in the online application for New Student Admission (PPDB), and a lack of understanding of zoning system regulations both from the community and the PPDB committee team..
5	(Rabbani, Chotimah, & Pasha, 2023)	Polemik Sistem Zonasi Ppdb Dalam Mewujudkan Pemerataan Pendidikan	The research findings will reflect a number of debates arising from the implementation of the zoning system in PPDB. This study is expected to provide an understanding of the impact and controversies arising from the use of the zoning system in PPDB.
6	(Sakti, 2020)	Problematika Implementasi Sistem Zonasi Sekolah Pada Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru Di Sman 1 Kandungan Tahun Ajaran 2019/2020	The research findings indicate that the concept of school zoning system refers to the technical guidelines outlined in East Java Regional Regulation No. 23 of 2019, which is based on the Ministry of Education and Culture Regulation No. 51 of 2018. The implementation of the school zoning system has led to various issues such as a decrease in students' motivation to learn, lack of understanding among the public

No	Researcher	Title	Result
7	(Yuliani, 2021)	Tinjauan Yuridis Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru Dalam Sistem Zonasi	about the concept of school zoning and the PPDB procedures, increased instances of fraud in the community, shortage of public schools in Indonesia, errors in the use of online systems, and inadequate socialization regarding the school zoning system. From the data analysis conducted, it can be concluded that Ministry of Education and Culture Regulation No. 44 of 2019 exhibits injustice. Article 31 paragraph (1) and paragraph (2) stipulate that in the admission of new students for junior high school and senior high school levels, priority is given to prospective students who live closest to the school in the designated zoning area; however, if the distance between the prospective student's residence and the school is the same, then selection is based on the older age of the student. Ideally, a more relevant selection criterion after distance should be the students' academic achievements. This criterion would be fairer than age criteria. Several factors hindering the PPDB with zoning system include limited number of favored schools, disparity in the distribution of education quality, and insufficient government efforts in socialization.

3.2. Discussion

Based on the literature study from journals and theses between 2021-2023, it is known that the implementation of the zoning system policy has been carried out in accordance with the Ministry of Education and Culture Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 51 of 2017 concerning the Admission of New Students in Kindergarten, Elementary School, Junior High School, Senior High School, and Vocational High School. However, there are several controversies that arise due to internal and external factors. Chotimah, et al. (2023) stated that the zoning system policy aims not only for equalizing access to educational services but also for equalizing the quality of education itself. The implementation of the PPDB with the zoning system as a new mechanism has changed the entire student admission system. The calculation in the zoning system benefits students who live close to the school, so they have equal rights to education regardless of their academic abilities. With the zoning system, each school has comparable facilities and no longer competes to become a favorite school. However, the implementation of the zoning system has raised concerns among parents of students. Six years after the zoning system was first implemented, concerns about its implementation have not subsided. In fact, the zoning system, which was expected to provide benefits, has actually made it difficult for many parties. Overall, the main problems in the zoning system in PPDB include several important aspects, including:

- a. Uncertain School Capacity

The first problem is the imbalance between the number of prospective students and the capacity of schools in their domicile areas. Intense competition to get a place in public schools means not all prospective students can enter schools close to their homes.

b. Minimal Socialization

The zoning system has caused much confusion for parents of prospective students. This is due to a lack of socialization about zoning, making registration guidelines and information difficult to understand, which then triggers many irregularities. As a result, the hope for achieving justice is not realized. The distribution of public schools in various districts or villages is uneven. According to Widyastuti (2020), the likelihood of students living far from school being accepted is very low, even if they have good grades, which encourages them to seek closer schools rather than higher-quality ones. This becomes an issue because the government has not been successful in creating equality in every school and addressing differences in quality among them. The implementation of the zoning system in PPDB is expected to address the education distribution issue in Indonesia. Indonesia aims to educate the nation as stated in the 1945 Constitution. It means that every citizen has the right to quality education according to their interests and talents, regardless of social status, race, ethnicity, religion, gender, or geographical location. However, in reality, education in Indonesia is still uneven. Data from the Central Statistics Agency in 2022 shows that many children in urban and rural areas are not attending school. The percentages are 0.71% for elementary school, 6.94% for junior high school, and 22.52% for senior high school, with a total of 30.17% of children not attending school in urban and rural areas. One of the reasons is poverty or economic factors within families, which cause children to drop out of school before completing their education. According to Maesarini Wahyu (2023), education distribution includes several important aspects, including providing free education up to a certain level as the main access to the workforce, offering a general curriculum for all students regardless of their backgrounds, providing the same schools for students from diverse backgrounds, and ensuring equal opportunities with financial support from local governments for schools.

Educational distribution also encompasses two crucial aspects: opportunity and fairness in accessing education within society. If access to education is equitable, all individuals of school age have equal opportunities to obtain education, while fairness ensures that every individual in society has the same right to receive education. The primary focus of educational distribution efforts is to ensure that all students have learning opportunities from elementary, middle, to upper secondary levels. The distribution of education at the elementary, junior high, and senior high school levels needs to be improved. Nanggala (2020) revealed that within the age group of 7-15 years, the net enrollment rate (NER) for compulsory 9-year education must reach a minimum of 95 percent annually. To address educational disparities, Indonesia has made various efforts through new educational policies. The zoning system is considered one way to ensure equitable access to education for all Indonesian citizens (Nanggala, 2020). However, the implementation of the zoning system does not always succeed in equalizing education in Indonesia due to various challenges hindering its implementation. The policy of implementing the zoning system is regulated in the Ministry of Education and Culture Regulation (Permendikbud) No. 14 of 2018 concerning the Admission of New Students.

Educational equity involves two main aspects: opportunity and fairness in access to education within society. When access to education is equitable, all school-aged individuals have

equal chances of obtaining education, while fairness ensures that every individual has equal rights to access education. The primary goal of educational equity efforts is to ensure that all students can access education from elementary, middle, to upper secondary levels fairly. The distribution of education at the elementary, junior high, and senior high school levels needs to be improved. According to Nanggala (2020), the net enrollment rate (NER) for compulsory 9-year education within the age group of 7-15 years must reach a minimum of 95 percent annually. To address educational disparities, Indonesia has implemented various new educational policies. The zoning system is considered a method to ensure equitable access to education for all Indonesian citizens (Nanggala, 2020). However, the implementation of the zoning system does not always succeed in achieving educational equity in Indonesia due to various obstacles hindering its implementation. The policy of implementing the zoning system is regulated in the Ministry of Education and Culture Regulation (Permendikbud) No. 14 of 2018 concerning the Admission of New Students.

4. Conclusion

The zoning system is a policy developed by the Ministry of Education and Culture in the Minister of Education and Culture Regulation No. 14 of 2018 concerning the Admission of New Students at various levels of education. The implementation of the zoning system aims to address educational challenges in Indonesia, particularly in terms of ensuring equitable access to education. Educational equity emphasizes the importance of equal access for all students. Essentially, the zoning system is considered an effective solution to achieve the goal of educational equity. However, there are still several problems caused by the limitations of the zoning system, such as insufficient school capacity, lack of socialization about the zoning system, and the inability to meet expectations of fairness. The zoning system also has negative impacts on teachers and students. The presence of the zoning system can reduce students' learning motivation because school admissions are based solely on proximity. Additionally, the government's lack of readiness in providing equitable educational facilities also hampers the success of the policy of implementing the zoning system in achieving educational equity in Indonesia.

References

- Chotimah, A. N., Pasha, J. F., & Rabbani, M. S. (2023). Polemik Sistem Zonasi PPDB dalam Mewujudkan Pemerataan Pendidikan. *JPBB: Jurnal Pendidikan, Bahasa Dan Budaya*, 1(3). Retrieved from <https://jurnal.alimspublishing.co.id/index.php/simpaty/article/view/227/209>
- Damayanti, E. (2021). *Problematika Birokrasi dalam Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru dengan Sistem Zonasi di SMP N 1 Saptosari Gunungkidul Yogyakarta* (UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta). UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta. Retrieved from <https://digilib.uin-suka.ac.id/id/eprint/45408/>
- Dyanti, D. (2020). *Problematika sistem zonasi penerimaan peserta didik baru tahun ajaran 2019 : Studi kasus SMAN 1 Bojongsoang Bandung, Desa Tegalluar, kecamatan Bojongsoang, Kabupaten Bandung, Provinsi Jawa Barat* (UIN Sunan Gunung Djati). UIN Sunan Gunung Djati. Retrieved from <https://digilib.uinsgd.ac.id/34938/>
- Frey, L. , Botan, C. H., & Kreps, G. L. (1999). *Investigating communication: An introduction to research methods (2nd ed.)*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Gall, M.D., J. P. G., & Borg, W. R. (2003). *Educational Research – and Introduction 7th Ed*. Boston: Pearson Education.
- Hasbullah, & Anam, S. (2019). *Evaluasi Kebijakan Sistem Zonasi Dalam Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru(PPDB) di Tingkat Sekolah Menengah Pertama Negeri(SMPN) di Kabupaten Pamekasan*. 9(2). Retrieved from <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/235210164.pdf>
- Khodijah, S., Mansur, R., & Nasrullah, M. E. (2020). Analisis Problematika Sistem Zonasi pada Keefektifan Proses Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam DI SMA NEGERI 2 MALANG. *VICRATINA: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*,

- 5(3). Retrieved from <https://jim.unisma.ac.id/index.php/fai/article/view/7073>
- Kitchenham, B. (2004). *Procedures for Performing Systemic Reviews*. Eversleigh: Keele University Technical Report.
- Maesarini Wahyu, I. S. (2023). Evaluasi Kebijakan Pendidikan Melalui Sistem Zonasi Di Indonesia. *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Publik*, 3(6). Retrieved from file:///C:/Users/SELLA/Downloads/3472-9723-1-SM.pdf
- Muammar. (2019). Problematika Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru (PPDB) dengan Sistem Zonasi di Sekolah Dasar (SD) Kota Mataram. *El-Midad: Jurnal PGMI*, 11(1). Retrieved from <https://journal.uinmataram.ac.id/index.php/elmidad/article/view/1904/1003>
- Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Nomor 14 Tahun 2018 tentang Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru Pada Taman Kanak-Kanak, Sekolah Dasar, Sekolah Menengah Pertama, Sekolah Menengah Atas, Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan, Atau Bentuk Lain Yang Sederajat*. (n.d.). Retrieved from <https://peraturan.bpk.go.id/Home/Details/138190/permendikbud-no-14-tahun-2018>
- Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Republik Indonesia Nomor 51 Tahun 2017 Tentang Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru Pada Taman Kanak-Kanak, Sekolah Dasar, Sekolah Menengah Pertama, Sekolah Menengah Atas, dan Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan*. (n.d.). Retrieved from [https://jdih.kemdikbud.go.id/arsip/PERMENDIKBUD NOMOR 51 TAHUN 2018.pdf](https://jdih.kemdikbud.go.id/arsip/PERMENDIKBUD%20NOMOR%2051%20TAHUN%202018.pdf)
- Rabbani, M. S., Chotimah, A. N., & Pasha, J. F. (2023). Polemik Sistem Zonasi PPDB dalam Mewujudkan Pemerataan Pendidikan. *JURNAL PENELITIAN PENDIDIKAN DAN BAHASA*, 1(3). Retrieved from <https://jurnal.alimspublishing.co.id/index.php/simpat/article/view/227>
- Rosmana, P. S., Sofyan Iskandar, Fadilah, N., Azhar, N., Oktavini, D., & Munte, A. C. (2022). Upaya Pemerataan Pendidikan Berkelanjutan di Daerah 3T. *Attadib: Journal of Elementary Education*, 6(2). Retrieved from <https://jurnalfai-uikabogor.org/index.php/attadib/article/view/1212/764>
- Sahira. (2023). Perencanaan Pemerataan Pendidikan di Pelosok Desa Sebagai Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan di Indonesia. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional "Peran Manajemen Pendidikan Untuk Menyiapkan Sekolah Unggul Era Learning Society 5.0" Departemen Administrasi Pendidikan Fakultas Ilmu Pendidikan*. Retrieved from <http://conference.um.ac.id/index.php/pses/article/view/7904/2350>
- Sakti, E. P. (2020). *Temuan penelitian akan menggambarkan berbagai polemik yang muncul terkait penerapan sistem zonasi dalam PPDB. Penelitian ini diharapkan dapat memberikan wawasan tentang dampak dan kontroversi yang muncul akibat penerapan sistem zonasi dalam PPDB* (IAIN Kediri). IAIN Kediri. Retrieved from <http://etheses.iainkediri.ac.id/2392/>
- Sihombing, E. N., & Hadit, C. (2021). Persamaan Hak Atas Pendidikan terhadap Penerapan Sistem Zonasi (Equality Of The Right To Education To The Application Of The Zoning System). *Jurnal HAM*, 12(2). Retrieved from file:///C:/Users/SELLA/Downloads/1815-7898-2-PB.pdf
- Sunandar, D., & Kurniawan, A. F. (2022). Problematika Implementasi Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru (PPDB) Sistem Zonasi di Sekolah Menengah Atas Negeri Rangkas Bitung Lebak Banten. *JPI: Jurnal Pendidikan Indonesia*, 2(5). Retrieved from <https://www.jurnal.penerbitwidina.com/index.php/JPI/article/view/240/212>
- Undang Undang Dasar Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 1945*. (n.d.). Retrieved from <https://www.dpr.go.id/jdih/uu1945>
- Widyastuti, R. T. (2020). Dampak Pemberlakuan Sistem Zonasi terhadap Mutu Sekolah dan Peserta Didik. *EduSainTEK: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sains, Dan Teknologi*, 7(1).
- Yuliani, N. (2021). Tinjauan Yuridis Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru dalam Sistem Zonasi. *Journal Presumption of Law*, 3(1). Retrieved from <https://www.ejournal.unma.ac.id/index.php/jpl/article/view/986>