



# TEACHERS' EXPERIENCES AND PERCEPTIONS OF THE COMPETENCY-BASED PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL SYSTEM AT MTS BAHRUL ULUM GENUKWATU

Zuliana Kholbu Nidhoh\*, Ahmad Nurabadi

State University of Malang, Jl. Semarang No. 5 Malang, East Java, Indonesia

\*Author of correspondence, Email: [zuliana.kholbu.2301316@students.um.ac.id](mailto:zuliana.kholbu.2301316@students.um.ac.id),  
[ahmad.nurabadi.fip@um.ac.id](mailto:ahmad.nurabadi.fip@um.ac.id)

## Abstract

This study aims to analyze the experiences and perceptions of teachers regarding the competency-based performance assessment system implemented at MTs Bahrul Ulum Genukwatu. The method used in this study is descriptive qualitative, with data collection through in-depth interviews with a number of teachers involved in the implementation of the system. The results of the study indicate that in general, teachers have a positive view of the implementation of the competency-based performance assessment system. They believe that this system is able to encourage improvements in the quality of teaching, professionalism, and work motivation. In addition, this system also provides clear and objective benchmarks in assessing teacher performance. However, there are several challenges faced, such as understanding the assessment instruments, the reporting process, and the fairly burdensome administrative burden. This study provides important insights into the challenges and opportunities faced in implementing a competency-based assessment system in the educational environment

**Keywords:** Performance assessment, Competency, Effectiveness assessment

## 1. Introduction

The development of competency-based teacher performance assessment methods is a crucial strategic step in efforts to improve the quality of education (Qurtubi 2023). The quality of education is often understood as the characteristics of educational services that meet certain standards to provide satisfaction to all parties involved, including students, parents and other stakeholders (Munawir et al. 2023). To ensure that quality is maintained, quality control is needed to monitor the process and all supporting components. The quality of education, in particular, is strongly influenced by the teaching and learning process in which the role of the teacher is very central. It is undeniable that teachers are the prime movers in this process. They create a supportive learning atmosphere for learners to explore interesting things, express, and express their ideas and creativity, of course, within the framework of consistently applied norms. Competency-based performance appraisal is an evaluation process carried out systematically on employees. This process aims to compare the competencies that employees currently have with the competencies expected for their position, as well as with the competencies needed to achieve company goals (Hernawa 2014).

Education has a crucial role as a foundation in shaping graduates who are not only measured by the achievement of academic standards, but also by the extent to which they master skills and knowledge that match the demands of the real world. In the face of a changing

era and increasingly complex educational challenges, evaluation approaches need to be contextual and comprehensive. This is important to provide a deeper understanding of a teacher's contribution to the overall development of education. Therefore, teacher performance assessment should not only focus on academic achievement but also on their ability to create an inclusive learning environment. This should include competence in creating a safe classroom that supports effective teaching and learning. A teacher will achieve good performance if he or she clearly understands his or her functions and duties (Najmulmunir 2009).

One of the main responsibilities of a manager or principal is to assess teacher performance. This assessment process is very important to evaluate the extent of the performance that has been achieved by the teachers, whether it is classified as good, medium, or less. This assessment is not only useful for the teachers themselves, but also for the school in determining future policies. Through this assessment method, teachers are encouraged to continuously improve the quality of their teaching their performance. With integrated feedback and performance assessment results, teachers can identify areas for improvement, plan improvement strategies, and participate in professional development activities (Hendratri and Khotimah 2022). Performance appraisals are conducted on teacher competencies in accordance with learning, mentoring, or additional tasks relevant to the functions of schools/madrasas. Specifically for learning or mentoring activities, the competencies used as the basis for teacher performance appraisal are pedagogic, professional, social, and personality competencies, (Abidin 2014) as stipulated in Minister of National Education Regulation No. 16/2007 on regulations governing academic qualification standards and teacher competencies. Competence is the ability that must be possessed by an employee to carry out their duties, which is reflected in various types and levels of behavior (Hidayati 2014).

Teacher performance appraisals should be detailed and precise, taking into account the following important aspects: 1) Objective, which means it must be in accordance with real conditions, 2) Fair, which means giving the same treatment to all teachers, whether known or unknown, without distinguishing one from another, 3) Accountable, which refers to trustworthy work and is a responsibility that each teacher must bear, 4) Helpful, where this assessment provides valuable experience for each teacher regarding their performance, 5) Transparent, which means openness in carrying out their responsibilities, 6) Goal-oriented, 7) Process-oriented, 8) Sustainable and Confidential. Process-oriented, 8) Sustainable and confidential. In addition, teachers' mastery of competencies, extensive knowledge, and creativity are very influential in creating a learning process that can help students achieve their dreams. The teacher performance appraisal system is designed to describe each teacher's ability in the learning process and explain their knowledge and skills (Muslikhin 2024). The underlying purpose of performance appraisal is to improve the performance of individual employees so as to lead to an increase in overall organizational performance (Manurung 2024).

This research is expected to contribute significantly to the understanding of teachers' experiences and perceptions of the competency-based performance appraisal system and its implications for teachers' professional development. In addition, the findings of this study are also expected to contribute to designing more relevant and significant training programs, in order to prepare teachers who are competent and ready to face challenges in accessing the expanding world of education.

## 2. Method

The results of this study use a type of qualitative research using descriptive methods. Qualitative research is a research method used to study subjects in a natural environment (Sugiyono 2019) without manipulation using natural methods, and without describing systematically. Data obtained qualitatively can follow and understand the flow of events in chronology. Qualitative research is considered appropriate for examining the objective conditions of the research subject so that procedures and approaches from outside and inside as part of qualitative research can take place properly. Data collection was carried out by means of observation, interviews, and documentation. This study aims to understand teachers' experiences and perceptions of the implementation of a competency-based performance appraisal system at Mts Bahrul Ulum.

## 3. Results and Discussion

### 3.1 Result

Based on the results of research conducted by researchers on the Experience and Perceptions of Teachers towards the Competency-Based Performance Appraisal System at Mts Bahrul Ulum are as follows:

#### 3.1.1 Competency-Based Performance Appraisal

From the results of observations by Mr. Dyan Budi as an Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teacher, he said that this competency-based performance appraisal is very effective. In assessing teacher performance at Mts Bahrul Ulum Genukwatu, each teacher is assessed based on four criteria. The four criteria are summarized in several stages of assessment, namely stages one, two, and three, which are used to determine the competence of each teacher. This assessment covers various aspects, starting from teaching tools contained in document one, assessment in document two, and attitude assessment in document three, and so on. Therefore, every teacher must be competent and prepare their tasks in accordance with the four criteria that have been established.

Observations show that in the appraisal system, teachers are assessed through several aspects summarized in specific documents, reflecting a more holistic approach to their competencies. In addition, the observations also show that the system encourages teachers to always improve their competence through the preparation of tasks that cover four main criteria. This is in line with the idea that competency-based assessment serves not only as an evaluation tool, but also as a mechanism that encourages the development of teacher professionalism (Tambun in Qurtubi, 2023). With this structured assessment, teachers are more encouraged to develop teaching methods that are more effective and in accordance with educational needs.

#### 3.1.2 Challenges in Competency-Based Teacher Performance Appraisal

In the process of competency-based performance appraisal, there are several challenges faced by teachers at Mts Bahrul Ulum Genukwatu, especially those who have not yet obtained a certificate of education. For example, based on the experience of one of the respondents, Mr. Dyan Budi, a teacher of Jurisprudence and Islamic Religious Education (PAI), he has never taken the competency test organized by the Ministry of Religious Affairs. Although he has

academic qualifications in accordance with the diploma obtained, the application of his competence is still limited to the madrasah environment where he teaches. Thus, he has not met the administrative and academic requirements to obtain an education certificate.

Observations of teacher performance appraisal at MTs Bahrul Ulum Genukwatu show that there are challenges in implementing a competency-based assessment model, especially for teachers who have not participated in education certification. This is in line with the opinion of Muslikhin (2024) who emphasizes that teacher performance assessment must be comprehensive and competency-based in order to reflect the overall quality of teaching.

### **3.1.3 Teachers' Experiences with Competency-Based Performance Assessment**

Respondents said that until now they have never taken the competency test organized by the Ministry of Religious Affairs. This is because the competency test process is still not carried out thoroughly in the scope of his work, especially for teachers who have not joined the Teacher Certification (Guser) program. The competencies he has so far are mostly applied in the context of teaching tasks in madrasah. This means that the scope of application of these competencies is still limited to the internal activities of educational institutions, not including strengthening among peers in the wider professional community. He also acknowledged that this is closely related to his status as an educator who has not yet obtained an educator certificate, which is one of the requirements for participating in the formal competency assessment and testing process.

### **3.1.4 Teachers' Perceptions of Competency-Based Performance Appraisal**

Teachers at Mts Bahrul Ulum Genukwatu view that performance is a form of self-assurance in carrying out tasks, while competence is defined as an ability that is in accordance with their educational background or diploma. According to him, a teacher needs to adjust in advance between the competencies possessed and the subject area being taught, because this is the basis for conveying competence to students. Teachers also added that the purpose of this competency assessment system is not only for students, but also as an effort for teachers to channel their abilities and ensure a match between their own competencies and the needs of classroom lessons. In addition, teachers consider that competency development can be done through learning from peers to complement the skills that have not been mastered.

### **3.1.5 Advantages and Disadvantages of Competency-Based Performance Appraisal**

Sources show that the competency-based performance appraisal system has advantages in competency-based assessment, namely, deepening teachers' understanding of their competencies, increasing confidence in teaching, and providing space for self-development. However, this system also has disadvantages in competency-based assessment, namely, uneven understanding of competencies among teachers and differences in the level of difficulty in applying them, because each teacher has different competency characteristics.

## **3.2 Discussion**

### **3.2.1. Competency-Based Performance Assessment**

Competency-based assessment methods allow for a more holistic assessment of a teacher's abilities. In addition to academic achievement, the assessment also includes aspects of teaching skills, communication skills, diversity, and involvement in curriculum development. That way, teachers are not only measured from the academic side, but also from their capacity to understand and respond to the needs of students and the surrounding community (Tambun in Qurtubi 2023). The characteristics of competence can be interpreted as a set of specific behaviors that can be observed and verified. These behaviors can be grouped logically and consistently, and have been identified as factors that are very influential on success in work (Nurmianto 2006).

Competency-based teacher assessment also creates impetus for curriculum development that is more responsive to labor market needs. Performance appraisal is a process of evaluating the results of work that has been done (Marwati 2021). Performance appraisal is one of the ways used to determine the extent of the quality of HR work owned by the company. This performance appraisal is beneficial for both the company and the employees themselves (Mayasari 2021). the importance of a competency-based performance management approach. Competencies include the knowledge, skills, and behaviors needed to carry out certain tasks effectively (Nailiu 2024). Teacher performance reflects the ability possessed by teachers in carrying out their duties, obligations, and responsibilities. This includes the process of educating, developing knowledge, acting as a second parent for students, and educating and forming the next generation of quality (Arifandi 2020). Performance appraisal is a formal procedure in an organization that aims to evaluate the contribution and role of employees (Saputra 2024).

### **3.2.2. Challenges of Competency-Based Performance Appraisal**

There are several challenges to be faced in implementing competency-based performance management. One of them is resistance to change from employees and management. The transition process from a traditional system to a competency-based approach requires time and effort to change mindsets and work habits (Syahputra & Tanjung, 2020). According to Muslikhin (2024), teacher performance appraisal must be comprehensive and competency-based in order to reflect the true quality of teaching. This model not only measures student academic achievement as an indicator of teacher performance, but also considers other aspects that support learning effectiveness. The main challenge lies in the inability of existing performance evaluation methods to cover all dimensions of teacher success, such as student academic achievement, without considering elements of interpersonal skills, innovation in teaching methods, or contributions to research and curriculum development (Awaluddin et al. in Qurtubi 2023).

### **3.2.3. Competency-Based Performance Assessment Experience**

The work experience of employees in a government or organization will affect the performance of the government or organization. Equipped with a lot of experience, the possibility of realizing a fairly experienced achievement or performance in carrying out one's duties will be more likely to fail (Astono D in Basyit 2020).According to (Mulyasa in Amri 2023), explaining the teacher's teaching experience is what the teacher has experienced while carrying out his duties as a teacher. Teachers have a great opportunity to learn from their teaching experience in the field rather than learning from various research and psychological

approaches. Teaching experience is something that makes no less important in determining teacher performance.

#### **3.2.4. Perception of Competency-Based Performance Appraisal**

Perception is a process in which a person gives meaning or interpretation to information or objects that come from their environment. Through this process, individuals can obtain certain meanings that have value for themselves (Fauziah, et al. in asmarni 2023). According to (megiati & pratiwi 2021) Teacher perception is a response from a teacher obtained through the process of knowing or recognizing objective objects and events in their environment with the help of their senses related to the leadership supervision of the madrasah head. The teacher's perception of the assessment that he must apply will certainly determine the success of its implementation. Perception includes receiving stimuli (inputs), organizing stimuli, and interpreting stimuli that have been organized in a way that can influence behavior and shape attitudes, so that people will tend to interpret the behavior of others according to their own circumstances (Gibson in Maryani 2017). (Cherington in Irmasari 2023) explains that performance reflects the achievement of work targets related to quality and time. According to (Kunandar in Rahman 2015), performance appraisal can be defined as an evaluation process that includes practical actions or tests. This process effectively serves to collect various information related to the forms of behavior or skills that students are expected to demonstrate.

#### **3.2.5. Advantages and Disadvantages of Competency-Based Performance Appraisal**

Competency-based performance management also has important implications for employee career development (Wahyuanto 2024). The advantages of implementing performance appraisals seem to far outweigh the disadvantages they may cause. Although there are some challenges in the performance appraisal process, it does not necessarily eliminate the importance of performance appraisal in managing human resources in an organization (Budiharto 2002). A competency-based performance appraisal system has significant advantages as it focuses on tangible work outcomes and offers a clear evaluation framework for assessing and training employees. However, despite its advantages, the system also has weaknesses. One of the challenges is the need for active involvement from supervisors and the difficulty in objectively measuring competencies, especially in qualitative aspects (Erica 2009).

## **4. Conclusion**

It can be concluded that the implementation of the competency-based performance appraisal system has generally run quite well and is positively received by teachers. Most teachers feel that this system is able to encourage improvements in work quality, professionalism, and motivation in carrying out learning tasks. In addition, this system is considered to provide clearer and more objective benchmarks in assessing teacher performance. However, there are still some obstacles, especially related to technical understanding of assessment instruments, reporting mechanisms, and school administration readiness. Therefore, there is a need for assistance, continuous training, and simplification of

procedures so that the implementation of this competency-based performance appraisal system can run more effectively, fairly, and have an equal positive impact on all educators in the madrasah environment.

## References

- Abidin, Z., & Sutrisno, S. (2014). Analisis Penilaian Kinerja Guru (PKG) dalam Upayanya Melakukan Penjaminan Mutu Guru di dalam Kelas (Studi Penelitian pada SMA/ sederajat Swasta Kec. Pasar Minggu Jakarta Selatan). *Research and Development Journal Of Education*, 1(1).
- Agustina, V. S. (2020). Pengembangan Model Kompetensi dan Perancangan Sistem Informasi Penilaian Kinerja Karyawan Berbasis Kompetensi Pada PT. Sucaco, Tbk.
- Ahmad, L. I. (2017). Konsep penilaian kinerja guru dan faktor yang mempengaruhinya. *Idaarah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 1(1).
- Amri, A., & Kamaruddin, K. (2023). Pengaruh Pengalaman Kerja, Beban Kerja dan Motivasi terhadap Kinerja Guru di SMK Negeri Kabupaten Bireuen. *IndOmera*, 4(7), 1-10.
- Arifandi, A. S. D. (2020). Evaluasi Kinerja Guru. *Edukais: Jurnal Pemikiran Keislaman*, 4(2), 106-119.
- Asmarni, T., & Zakir, S. (2023). Persepsi Guru MTsN 1 Lima Puluh Kota Tentang Asesmen Kompetensi Minimum. *Arus Jurnal Pendidikan*, 3(1), 6-14.
- Basyit, A., Sutikno, B., & Dwiharto, J. (2020). Pengaruh tingkat pendidikan dan pengalaman kerja terhadap kinerja karyawan. *Jurnal Ema*, 5(1), 12-20.
- Budiharto, S., & Fahmie, A. (2002). Evaluasi Sistem Penilaian Kinerja Pegawai Administratif Tetap Universitas Islam Indonesia Yogyakarta. *Psikologika: Jurnal Pemikiran dan Penelitian Psikologi*, 7(13), 43-52.
- Erica, D. (2009). Teknik Penilaian Berbasis Kompetensi terhadap Karyawan. *Cakrawala-Jurnal Humaniora*, 9(2), 26-36.
- Hernawa, R., & Tresni, L. (2014). Penyusunan Penilaian Kinerja Berbasis Kompetensi di Rumah Sakit XXX. *Humanitas*, 11(1), 69.
- Hendratri, B. G., & Khotimah, F. K. (2022). Transisi Sumber Daya Manusia Sebelum Dan Sesudah Covid-19, Ditelaah Dari Perspektif Ekonomi Syariah. *Jurnal Dinamika Ekonomi Syariah*, 9(2), 144-157.
- Hidayati, I. (2014). *Analisis penerapan sistem manajemen kinerja berbasis kompetensi (Studi pada PT Petrokimia Gresik)* (Doctoral dissertation, Brawijaya University).
- Irmasari, D. (2023). Pengaruh Persepsi Atas Kepemimpinan Kepala Sekolah dan Profesionalisme Guru terhadap Kinerja Guru pada SMK Swasta di Kota Depok. *Herodotus: Jurnal Pendidikan IPS*, 6(1), 112-121.
- Mayasari, I., Haryanti, K., & Hindiarto, F. (2012). Penilaian Kinerja Berdasarkan Kompetensi Dan Kpi (Key Performer Indicator) Perusahaan Daerah Air Minum Kabupaten Semarang. *PREDIKSI*, 1(2), 224.
- Maryani, I. & Martaningsih, T. S. (2017). Persepsi Guru Sekolah Dasar Terhadap Sistem Penilaian Pada Kurikulum 2013
- Marwiati, M., & Fahrurrozi, M. (2021). E-log book untuk penilaian kinerja kompetensi perawat klinis. *Jurnal Kepemimpinan Dan Manajemen Keperawatan*, 4(2), 177-182.
- Megiati, Y. E., & Pratiwi, N. K. (2021). Persepsi Guru atas Supervisi Kepemimpinan Kepala Madrasah Terhadap Kinerja Guru. *SAP (Susunan Artikel Pendidikan)*, 6(1).
- Munawir, M., Yasmin, A., & Wadud, A. J. (2023). Memahami Penilaian Kinerja Guru. *Jurnal Ilmiah Profesi Pendidikan*, 8(1b), 627-634.
- Manurung, M. A. P., Aswaruddin, A., Livianti, L., Hidma, C. A., Maysarah, N. S., & Wahyuni, I. (2024). Pentingnya evaluasi penilaian kinerja. *JISPENDIORA Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Pendidikan Dan Humaniora*, 3(1), 77-84.

- Muslikhin, M. (2024). PENGEMBANGAN MODEL PENILAIAN KINERJA GURU YANG BERBASIS KOMPETENSI UNTUK MENINGKATKAN AKUNTABILITAS DALAM PENDIDIKAN. *UNISAN JURNAL*, 3(2), 899-909.
- Nailiu, S. K. ., Prasetyo, A. ., Atmoko, A. P. ., Rafadhil, M. I. ., & Resmawa, I. N. . (2024). Pengembangan Model Manajemen Kinerja Berbasis Kompetensi Untuk Meningkatkan Kinerja Dan Pengembangan Karir Karyawan. *Jurnal Review Pendidikan Dan Pengajaran*, 7(2), 6029-6034.
- Najmulmunir, N., Hasyim, A. W., & Jubaedah, D. (2009). Hubungan Persepsi Guru Terhadap Peran Supervisi Kepala Sekolah dan Disiplin Kerja dengan Kinerja Guru Madrasah Tsanawiyah Negeri Kota Bogor. *Edukasi*, 1(2), 23-34.
- Nugraha, E., & Sari, R. M. (2016). Perancangan Sistem Penilaian Kinerja Karyawan Berbasis Kompetensi. *Jurnal SIFO Mikroskil*, 17(2), 207-214.
- Nurmianto, E., & Siswanto, N. (2006). Perancangan Penilaian Kinerja Karyawan Berdasarkan Kompetensi Spencer Dengan Metode Analytical Hierarchy Process (Studi Kasus di Sub Dinas Pengairan Dinas Pekerjaan Umum Kota Probolinggo). *Jurnal Teknik Industri: Jurnal Keilmuan dan Aplikasi Teknik Industri*, 8(1), 40-53.
- Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan Nasional Republik Indonesia Nomor 16 tahun 2007 Tentang Standar Kualifikasi Akademik dan Kompetensi Guru.
- Qurtubi, A. ., Rukiyanto, B. A. ., Rusmayani, N. G. A. L. ., Hita, . I. P. A. D. ., Nurzaima, N., & Ismaya, R. . (2023). Pengembangan Metode Penilaian Kinerja Guru Berbasis Kompetensi Untuk Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan Tinggi. *Jurnal Review Pendidikan Dan Pengajaran*, 6(4), 3051-3061.
- Rahman, S. A., Iswatiningsih, S., & Romdhani, M. (2015). Persepsi guru terhadap penilaian autentik pada kurikulum 2013 di SD. *Jurnal Sekolah Dasar*, 2(24), 151-160.
- Rosidah, A. S., Rahman, W. I., Aulia, M., Ariansyah, R., & Fauzi, I. (2022). Penilaian Kinerja Guru di Sekolah Dasar Antara Tantangan dan Peluang. *DIMAR: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 4(1), 1-23.
- Saputra, O., & Heliyani. (2024). Analisis Implementasi Sistem Penilaian Kinerja Pegawai Pada Badan Kepegawaian Dan Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia . *Jurnal Ekobistek*, 13(3), 120-128.
- Sugiyono, S. (2019). Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif Kuantitatif Dan R&D. *Bandung: Cv. Alfabeta*.
- Syahputra, M. D., & Tanjung, H. (2020). Pengaruh kompetensi, pelatihan dan pengembangan karir terhadap kinerja karyawan. *Maneggio: Jurnal Ilmiah Magister Manajemen*, 3(2), 283-295.
- Tambun, E., Taringan, M. I., dkk. (2023). Pengaruh Deskripsi Kerja, Jenjang Karir, Motivasi Kerja Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan Pada Pt. Agronesia Raya Medan. *KUKIMA: Kumpulan Karya Ilmiah Manajemen*, 2(2).
- Wahyunto, E., Heriyanto, H., & Hastuti, S. (2024). Study of the use of augmented reality technology in improving the learning experience in the classroom. *West Science Social and Humanities Studies*, 2(05), 700-705.